

Minutes of the 3rd Meeting of  
the Lift and Escalator Safety Advisory Committee (LESAC)

Date: 17 January 2014 (Friday)  
Time: 2:30 p.m.  
Venue: Room 7102, EMSD Headquarters, 3 Kai Shing Street, Kowloon Bay

Present:	Dr. POON Lok-to, Otto	Chairman
	Mr. CHUNG Fuk-wai, Simon	Member
	Mr. YEUNG Man-kai, Gary	Member
	Mr. KUOK Hoi-sang	Member
	Mr. LI Kwan-chi, Simon	Member
	Mr. TSE King-wa	Member
	Mr. WONG Kai-hon, Charles	Member
	Mr. YU Siu-fai, Ivan	Member
	Mr. CHUI Chun-king, Simon	Member
	Mr. LUI Kam-tong	Member
	Mr. WAN Chun-wah, Martin	Member
	Mr. WOO Kin-ming	Member
	Ms. WAN Siu-ling, Emily	Member
In attendance:	Ms. Angela YUEN	On behalf of Mr. TO Wing
	Mr. POON Tai-fai	On behalf of Mr. KWOK Sai-wang
	Ms. Rossana WONG	On behalf of Ms. LI Tsau-ha, Jessica
	Mr. WU Kwok-yuen, Jacky	Development Bureau
	Mr. CHEUNG Kwok-fai	EMSD
	Mr. CHUI Wai-sing	EMSD
	Mr. PANG Yiu-hung, Eric	EMSD
	Mr. CHU Kei-ming, Barry	EMSD
	Mr. LAU Lik-kee	EMSD
	Mr. NG Tak-hei	EMSD
Absent with Apologies:	Ms. CHOI Ngar-chun, Ada	Member
	Mr. TO Wing, Christopher	Member
	Ms. LI Tsau-ha, Jessica	Member
	Mr. KWOK Sai-wang	Member

Action

1. Confirmation of Minutes of the Last Meeting (Agenda Item 1)

1.1 Members did not raise any amendment to the minutes of the 2nd meeting. The

Chairman declared the minutes of the 2nd meeting officially confirmed.

## 2. Progress Report by the Working Group on Matters Relating to Responsible Persons (Agenda Item 2)

Mr. YEUNG Man-kai, the convener for the Working Group on Matters Relating to Responsible Persons (Working Group on Responsible Persons), reported that two meetings were held by the working group on 27 November 2013 and 8 January 2014 respectively. Progress of work and the discussion at the Advisory Committee meeting are as follows:

### 2.1 Proposal for Improving the Contractors' Performance Rating Scheme

#### EMSD

After discussion at the two meetings, the Working Group on Responsible Persons recommended revising the presentation of Contractors' Performance Ratings by adopting the format of "Safety Star" + "Quality Star". It was recommended that contractors with no instance of safety non-compliance would be given a green star (★) under "safety performance", while maintenance quality would be indicated by the number of blue stars (★). Contractors earning 100 points in a quarter would be awarded four stars, while contractors earning 100 points for two consecutive quarters would be awarded five stars. Contractors with instance of safety non-compliance would not be awarded with any "Quality Star", i.e. same as Category III of the existing categories. The classification of star ratings under the proposed rating scheme is detailed below:

Existing format of announcement	New Presentation format	
Category	"Safety Star" + "Quality Star"	
Category I: Those showing good performance with no non-compliances found in both safety and maintenance aspects	★ + ★★★★★	No non-compliances found in both safety and maintenance aspects in two recent quarterly announcements
	★ + ★★★★★	No non-compliances found in both safety and maintenance aspects
Category II: Those with no non-compliances found in safety aspect, but with room for improvement in maintenance aspect	★ + ★★★	No non-compliances found in safety aspect; maintenance score of 90 to 99
	★ + ★★	No non-compliances found in safety aspect; maintenance score of 80 to 89
	★ + ★	No non-compliances found in safety aspect; maintenance score of 70 to 79

	★	No non-compliances found in safety aspect; maintenance score below 70
Category III: Those with non-compliances found in safety aspect, thus served with warning letter, and further investigation is in progress	-	Those with non-compliances found in safety aspect, thus served with warning letter, and being further investigated will not be awarded "Safety Star" and "Quality Star"

Members expressed the following views with regard to the star rating scheme for Contractors' Performance Rating:

- A member considered that it would be too harsh not to award any rating to contractors with non-compliance found in safety aspect under the new presentation format, as the record of non-compliance would be kept for twelve months and might affect public perception of the contractor who therefore would not be given chance for improvement. This would affect the contractor's business operation and might lead to its closure.
- A member responded to the above view that while the non-compliant contractor might be hampered in bidding for new contracts, the existing contracts were not affected and there had been no instance of closure of business for any contractor due to non-compliance found in safety aspect. The member also agreed that EMSD should deal with non-compliant contractors more rigorously.
- A member remarked that the public, due to a lack of information, were not able to make an informed decision on the performance of contractors who were not given any stars. However, under the above circumstances, the award of a "Quality Star" in the absence of a "Safety Star" would also confuse. EMSD pointed out that the public could now make use of the Contractors' Performance Rating webpage to find out the performances of individual contractors (e.g., whether a contractor had received any warning letter due to a safety incident, etc.).
- A member reckoned that there were different severities in terms of non-compliance. It was inappropriate to rate the seriousness of a non-compliance just by stating "no star awarded". The meeting came to the consensus that the remark "no star awarded" should be deleted and cases of safety non-compliance should be attached with appropriate explanatory notes. It was suggested that to make it more convenient to the public, there should be more elaboration on the non-compliance of the contractors who were not given any stars.

After deliberation, the following conclusions were reached on the star rating scheme for Contractors' Performance Rating:

- Members were agreed on the presentation format and the rating criteria of "Quality Star".
- Members agreed that no "Quality Star" would be awarded to non-compliant contractors, and the Working Group on Responsible Persons would review the details of the explanatory notes that would be added.
- Members agreed that the star rating scheme should be adopted as the presentation format of the new quarterly performance rating results for the registered lift and escalator contractors.

## 2.2 Publication of Pricing Data on Maintenance Service for Government Lifts

EMSD

- The Working Group on Responsible Persons agreed with the proposal that EMSD should publish the average monthly price for the maintenance of government lifts. It was suggested that analysis should be made of the price of maintenance contracts for government lifts awarded through open tender in the past three years, according to type of government buildings, number of floors, and lift characteristics. An additional note should be provided with the price data to explain that the lifts at government buildings usually require more frequent maintenance services than stipulated in the law and have a different maintenance charge regime than those of the same model installed at private sector buildings. EMSD planned to officially publish the price data in end January the earliest and thereafter update the data once every six months. There were also plans to explore the publication of maintenance price data of lifts on private property.
- A member considered that as the maintenance terms for government lifts were different from those for the private sector lifts, so the prices published might not be directly comparable. EMSD stated that the published price data would enable the public to know the maintenance cost for government lifts in terms of overall compliance with specific maintenance service requirements. In engaging a registered lift contractor to provide maintenance service for the lifts, the responsible person for lifts might refer to the price data, compare price against the services required, and make the right choice.

EMSD

- A member suggested that the technical details should be provided in the appendix. EMSD would amend the content of the appendix in view of this suggestion.
- After deliberation, Members agreed that EMSD should publish the maintenance price data of lifts at government buildings at the end of this month.

## 2.3 Publicity on General Duties of Responsible Persons

- Forty-eight talks, attended by about 4 000 participants, were organized by EMSD in collaboration with district offices and professional bodies in 2013.

With a view to raising the awareness of the responsible persons in carrying out their management duties, these talks introduced to the community the Lifts and Escalators Ordinance and the duties of the responsible persons, and the ways to manage the lifts and escalators, as well as promoting lift and escalator safety and modernization of aged lifts.

EMSD

- In consultation with the Working Group on Responsible Persons, EMSD has produced the booklet "How to Manage Lift and Escalator Maintenance Work". It will be distributed to general public as well as being made available online for reference. Moreover, a short promotional video of 30 seconds is also being made by EMSD to encourage the responsible persons to modernise their aged lifts. Two more short videos with a total of running time of 60 minutes will be produced to strengthen the understanding of the responsible persons concerning the maintenance of lifts and escalators.

EMSD

- Meanwhile, in order to enable better understanding of the seven solutions for enhancement of aged lifts, EMSD wrote to the responsible persons at private buildings of over 40 years last September to offer goodwill visits. Responsible persons at 49 of these buildings have expressed interest in this offer. The goodwill visits would begin in this month to enable the responsible persons to have a better understanding of the seven enhancement solutions for the aged lifts at their buildings.

### 3. Progress Report by the Working Group on Matters Relating to the Trade (Agenda Item 3)

Mr. CHUNG Fuk-wai, the convener for the Working Group on Matters Relating to the Trade (Working Group on the Trade), reported that the working group held their second meeting on 11 December 2013. Their work progress is as follows:

#### 3.1 Repeal of the Relevant Provisions on "Competent Worker"

- The Legislative Council had completed its scrutiny of the Lifts and Escalators Ordinance (Commencement) Notice 2013 on 27 November 2013 without amendment. Relevant provisions on "competent lift / escalator worker" were repealed as scheduled on 2 January 2014. After the repeal, the term "qualified persons" does not include "competent lift / escalator worker". Those who only qualify as "competent lift and escalator worker" are not allowed to personally engage in lift works or escalator works, unless under the direct supervision of "qualified persons".

#### 3.2 Opinion Survey Among the Lift and Escalator Trade

EMSD

- In order to have a better understanding of the state of the local lift and escalator trade, including its pay structure, manpower structure, conditions of employment and the concerns of the trade practitioners, an independent consultancy firm has been commissioned by EMSD to conduct an industry opinion survey to facilitate the formulation of long term strategies. Under this survey, interviews will be conducted among contractors, engineers and workers. The consultancy firm will subsequently send questionnaires to all

registered contractors and make telephone calls to all registered engineers as part of the survey. As for the registered workers, telephone interviews will be conducted with 1 200 workers, chosen by random sampling and according to the different work categories. A report will be submitted afterwards. When the survey results are available, EMSD will invite the Advisory Committee to assist in the review of these long term strategies and offer their views.

### 3.3 New Technology for Lifts

The Working Group on Matters Relating to the Trade had studied the following new technological options:

1. Remote monitoring device – it can monitor the conditions of the lift and enable real-time contact with the lift company by inter-communication device in the lift car, or by telephone or e-mail. The lift company can transmit maintenance messages to the technician's mobile device so as to carry out repair work or tackle lift failures immediately by remote control. The remote monitoring device has already adopted in Europe and other countries. It is not widely adopted in Hong Kong mainly because it can only monitor signals of service suspension but cannot identify the specific problem of a lift component.
2. Lift shaft image transmission device – through the installation of a CCTV system and sound detection device at the top of the lift car, the conditions of the lift shaft can be monitored from the lift car and from the control room. Management staff can monitor the lift shaft at all times by this device. If any abnormal noises are detected, or if there is any obstruction or failure whilst the lift is in operation, the problem can be identified immediately and repair work can be carried out before lift failure actually happens.
3. Rope monitoring device – EMSD introduced the rope monitoring device at the meeting. Broken wires in the rope will be detected by a sensing switch, which will then activate the safety device and stop the operation of the lift. However, the device can only detect the protruded parts of the broken wires, but not other kinds of damage, such as rust, rouge, reduction in diameter, wear and tear. In addition, after the installation of rope gripper, there may not be enough space for the installation of the rope monitoring device.
4. EMSD also briefed members on the use of the automatic lubrication device, which is applicable to lifts. It can provide automatic lubrication in accordance with a pre-set schedule to ensure that the rope is sufficiently lubricated. This can prevent the rope from rusting, extend the service life of the rope and shorten maintenance time.

EMSD

Moreover, EMSD will organise seminars in collaboration with the trade this year to promote the use of new technologies. EMSD is also considering engaging a consultant to conduct further studies.

### 3.4 Survey on Maintenance Time for Lifts

EMSD

To identify a reasonable and generally acceptable standard for required maintenance time and an appropriate ratio of lift maintained to lift worker, EMSD

conducted a preliminary analysis of the log-book records of 100 lifts, covering the time needed for such work as day to day maintenance, emergency repair and rescue work in respect of different lift models and contractors. In collaboration with the Lift and Escalator Contractors Associations, EMSD has been collecting information regarding the time needed by contractors in the conduct of day to day maintenance, emergency repair and rescue work in respect of typical lift models, followed up with site inspections accordingly. When the preliminary results are available, a consultancy firm may be invited to conduct a more thorough analysis.

### 3.5 Strengthening Publicity on General Duties of Registered Engineers and Registered Workers

#### EMSD

- To enhance registered engineers' and registered workers' understanding of their duties, EMSD has prepared promotional leaflets titled "The Duties of Registered Lift and Escalator Worker" and "The Duties of Registered Lift and Escalator Engineer". A short publicity video on the general duties of registered workers is also in the process of being produced.
- Briefings have also been organised by EMSD for registered engineers and registered workers. These include:
  - (1) Registered engineers
    - Two briefings were organised for registered engineers in November and December 2013 with a total of attendance of 180.
  - (2) Registered workers
    - A briefing was organised for registered workers in December 2013 with around 104 worker representatives and trainees from the registered contractors attending.

### 3.6 Matters on the Occupational Safety and Health of Workers

- EMSD shared with members on proposals regarding the design review of lifts for footbridges. It is recommended that the installation of air conditioners should be avoided but additional louvres used instead to improve ventilation. The thickening of the walls and the addition of ventilation fans or a heat insulation film on the glass panel are also suggested to refine the ventilation design, thereby improving the work conditions in the lift shaft.
- EMSD and the Lift and Escalator Contractors Association have suggested to the Buildings Department that an access door should be provided for a lift well with a depth of over 1.6 meters, and sufficient space be allowed between lifts in the shared lift shaft.
- A member remarked that the Guidelines on Safety of Lift Shaft Works (Volume 3), prepared by the Construction Industry Council (CIC), would be widely publicised and distributed in February 2014. It was hoped that worker safety would be enhanced with the guidelines being adopted at all work sites. CIC will be collaborating with EMSD this year in the promotion of lift

safety to responsible persons so as to achieve a synergy effect.

- A member observed that for machine room-less lifts, a platform should be provided during maintenance work for the lift braking system to ensure workers' safety and facilitate their access to the equipment concerned for repair. EMSD undertook to review the maintenance issue involving machine room-less lifts and make improvement after consultation with the trade.

#### 4. Latest Progress on Registered Engineers and Registered Workers (Agenda item 4)

- 4.1 EMSD reported that as at the end of 2013, a total of 5 003 persons had successfully qualified as registered lift/escalator workers. Meanwhile, a total of 300 persons had successfully qualified as registered lift/escalator engineers.

#### 5. Review on Incident(s) (Agenda Item 5)

- 5.1 EMSD reported that there were 330 and 1 416 cases of lift incidents and escalator incidents respectively in 2013. The major cause of the incidents was improper use by passengers. As compared with 2012, the main reason for the rise in number of lift incidents was that the Lifts and Escalators Ordinance had extended its coverage to lifts and escalators under the Government and the Housing Authority. The number of lift incidents in 2013 also included that of the Government and the Housing Authority as well. The decrease in the number of escalator incidents was mainly due to the enhanced promotional campaign of escalator safety by the MTRC in 2013.

##### 5.2 North Point Lift Incident

- EMSD reported that the registration of Shineford Engineering Limited as a registered lift contractor and registered escalator contractor was cancelled with effect from 16 October 2013.
- The Department of Justice had initiated prosecution against Shineford Engineering Limited and its two directors, the registered lift engineer and the registered lift workers. Appearing before the court at Eastern Magistracy on 3 December 2013, all of the defendants pleaded not guilty. The case was adjourned to 18 February 2014.

##### 5.3 Registered Lift Contractor and Engineer Subject to Disciplinary Actions

- The Registered Lift Contractor Disciplinary Board and the Registered Lift Engineer Disciplinary Board (the Boards) had completed the disciplinary hearings of four cases against a registered lift contractor and a registered lift engineer. The Boards ruled that both had contravened the relevant regulations of the Lifts and Escalators (Safety) Ordinance. Details are as follows:



<b>Registered Lift Contractor</b>	<b>Registered Lift Engineer</b>
Lift incident at Heng Shan House, Heng On Estate, Ma On Shan	Lift incident at Heng Shan House, Heng On Estate, Ma On Shan
Lift incident at Hiu Ming Court, Hiu Kwong Street, Kwun Tong	
A lift at Viet Luen Factory Building, Wai Yip Street, Kwun Tong was in contravention of the requirements of the Code of Practice	
<b>A fine of \$240,000</b>	<b>Reprimanded</b>

**6. Any other business (Agenda item 6)**

- 6.1 The CIC will organise a technical seminar on Safety of Lift Shaft Works (Guidelines, Volume 3) on 12 February 2014, and participation by members and other organisations is welcome.
- 6.2 The Chairman reported that a press briefing would follow the meeting to announce the revised presentation format of the Registered Lift and Escalators Contractors' Performance Rating System which introduces a simpler and clearer way to facilitate the responsible persons for lifts and escalators to choose between registered contractors offering maintenance and repair services.

**7. Date of next meeting**

- 7.1 The next meeting will be held in July 2014. Members will be informed of the date of next meeting in due course.
- 7.2 The meeting was adjourned at 5 pm.